

Urban Governance Case Study: Detailed Questions

Impact of Infrastructure and Governance Transformations of JNNURM on Large, Medium and Small Cities
Centre for Urban Policy and Governance, School of Habitat Studies, Tata Institute of Social Sciences, Mumbai
April 1, 2013 to August 31, 2015

The table provides linkages between the broad research questions, key questions, sub-questions, detailed probes and potential sources for answering these questions.

The Broad Research Questions are the focus questions of the urban governance case study. different tasks and sub questions contribute to answering the broad research questions which are indicated.

Key Questions link broad research questions with themes for analysis in the case study

Sub-questions are specific questions which should be covered in case studies

Detailed Probes are the themes for research and analysis

Potential Sources are documentary sources and list of key informants who may be able to answer the probes. The list of informants are meant to be broad. The teams should prepare a list of informants under different categories who will be the most relevant and informative for the study.

Broad Research Questions	Key questions	Sub-Questions	Detailed Probes	Potential Sources
How has ULB and urban governance system been affected by the experience of implementing JNNURM projects and reforms	How do we understand the urban local body's role in urban governance eco system prior to JNNURM?	What was the status of the ULB as a unit of governance ? - its finances, service delivery, performance?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Financial profile and size of budgets- record of tax collection, which taxes imp, profile of grants over years, ability to undertake capital development projects, ability to expend, fulfill obligations,gender budget/budget for SC/ST - Overall service levels in city, difference in service levels in well served and underserved areas, role of ULB in service delivery - Role of ULB in urban planning- Preparation of Development Plans/master Plans? 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Documents from ULB- Information related, budgets 2. Secondary statistics on service levels in the city (Census Data, CDP) 3. Analysis of Master/Regional Development Plans of the City 4. Interviews with officials in ULBs- finance related, urban poverty alleviation, JNNURM, 5. Interviews with elected representatives 6. Interviews with academicians and

			- Role of ULB in management of informal settlements (slums, unauthorised constructions)	researchers on the city
		What was the status of the ULB as a political/representative body ?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Relationship between elected wing and executive wing – legally and as practised? - Profile of councillors – their interests, political parties and participation in the deliberations of the ULB - Status of executive wing – profile of officials, their interface with state government - Relationship of the ULB as a political body with the state government - Role of decision making for elected and executive wing and dynamics between them 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Relevant documents- History of ULB, Municipal Acts 2. Interviews with officials 3. Interviews with elected representatives
		Were there any major initiatives to 'reform' the ULB functioning in the last few years? If so, what was their impact on the ULB ? Were there initiatives in other arenas that have impacted functioning of the ULB?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Major initiatives of the urban local body that have received state or national level attention - State level initiatives that have been implemented in the ULB which has had far reaching impact on ULB- Financial and administrative reforms - Reform Conditionalities/Initiatives funded by multi-lateral funding agencies 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Relevant documents on reform initiatives 2. Interviews with ULB officials 3. Interviews with elected representatives
	What are the key drivers, dynamics of society, economy and government in the city?		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The major social groups in the city and their role in local politics - Economic characteristics of the city, key sectors and major industrial/business groups in the city, their role in local politics - Role of religious institutions, ethnic associations, trade unions, committees, business and trade associations and so on who are informally active in governance of the city 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Secondary literature on the economy and society of the city 2. Interviews with informants from relevant organisations and industrial/trade associations, journalists 3. Interviews with academicians/researchers
	What are the key		- Formal Relationships of ULB with	1. Institutional mapping of urban

	institutional relationships which are critical for the ULB in terms of planning and delivery of services? How do we understand ULBs role in these relationships		Institutions/agencies/parastatals (State and Local) that play an important role in planning and delivery of urban services. For eg. development authorities and water boards - Hierarchies, Power dynamics and politics between ULB and parastatal agencies and factors that affect these dynamics	governance system in the city and state. 2. Interviews with state level urban development dept. officials and planners 3. Interviews with ULB officials 4. Interviews with parastatal officials 5. Interviews with retired officials 6. Interviews with journalists, academicians and researchers
What are the intra and supra sectoral changes in the urban local body/ governance eco system caused by JNNURM and its reform agenda?	What are some of the changes in ULB as a result of JNNURM reforms	What are the supra-sectoral changes caused by JNNURM in urban governance system?	- State governments position on various reforms - How much alignment is there between ULB and state governments position on reforms - Status of Reforms in ULB 1. Transfer of powers and functions to ULBs in JNNURM 2. Changes in staffing patterns in ULB as a result of JNNURM 3. Role of consultants in ULB and result of their influence on existing municipal staff and capacity of ULB 4. Changes in user charges and reasons for these changes 5. Resistance to staff reduction in ULBs ,outsourcing of work to consultants esp from municipal staff 6. Resistance to user charges by citizen groups, civil society organisations, urban poor or other groups 7. PPP mode of doing projects and its impact, resistances to PPPs 8. Use of land and other assets as resource to earn revenues for ULB	1. Documents related to JNNURM- Setting up of institutions and reforms 2. Interviews with ULB staff- dealing with reforms, municipal staff union/association members 3. Interviews with citizens groups on impact of JNNURM reforms and resistance against reforms 4. Interviews with consultants who were involved in JNNURM in ULB
		How do we understand intra sectoral changes caused by JNNURM	- Changes in governance systems within ULB and parastatals for particular sectors as result of JNNURM	1. Interviews with sector related officials of ULB/parastatals 2. Interviews with different levels of staff

		and its impact on ULB and parastatals?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Status of Specific reforms related to the sectors taken up for study in the ULB – Water, Transport, Housing, Sewerage - Has JNNURM restructured the sectoral governance institutions and processes, if yes, how 	3. Interviews with citizen groups and associations of urban poor
How has regional political economy influenced implementation of JNNURM? What are its impacts on ULB and urban governance system?		How do we understand role of land and real estate actors in governance eco-system?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Role have Land and Real Estate actors such as builders, developers, in the city played in JNNURM - Network between these actors and others such as politicians, bureaucracy in context of JNNURM 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Mapping the Real Estate development in the city briefly- through newspaper reports, documents and interviews with key informants. 2. Interviews with political party representatives 3. Interviews with officials at state and ULB level related to JNNURM
		How do we understand role of state level actors and drivers in JNNURM?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - State level actors have become prominent as a result of JNNURM - Views of political parties in the city on JNNURM? 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Interviews with state level officials 2. Interviews with ULB officials 3. Interview with political party leaders in the city
	How do we understand the transformations of governance eco-system in ULB as a result of JNNURM	What have been the shifts in governance trajectory in the city before JNNURM?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Reforms that have transformed governance – as result of central/state/local initiatives, international funding agencies or other external actors - Post liberalisation shift in the ULBs governance system in context of changes at the state level 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Review of JNNURM related documents 2. Institutional mapping of urban governance system in ULB 3. Interviews with ULB/Parastatal officials
		What are the shifts in governance trajectory of the city that can be traced to JNNURM or accompanied by JNNURM?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - ULB as a local government - Parastatals as institutions that deliver services - Private companies that are involved in urban services - New institutions set up as a result of JNNURM 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Interviews with ULB officials those related to JNNURM 2. Interviews with parastatal officials 3. Interviews with officials of private companies
		How do we understand the changes in relationships of power between governance	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Changes in ULBs relationships with other agencies/institutions in governance eco system as a result of JNNURM - Changes in relationship between State and 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Interviews with ULB officials those related to JNNURM 2. Interviews with parastatal officials 3. Interviews with state level officials

	institutions in the city?	ULB as a result of JNNURM	
--	---------------------------	---------------------------	--